

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION FOR THE
ADVANCEMENT OF COLORED PEOPLE,
SPRING VALLEY BRANCH; JULIO
CLERVEAUX, CHEVON DOS REIS; ERIC
GOODWIN; JOSE VITELIO GREGORIO;
DOROTHY MILLER; HILLARY
MOREAU; AND WASHINGTON
SANCHEZ,

Plaintiffs,

v.

EAST RAMAPO CENTRAL SCHOOL
DISTRICT and MARYELLEN ELIA, IN
HER CAPACITY AS THE
COMMISSIONER OF EDUCATION OF
THE STATE OF NEW YORK,

Defendants.

Case No. 17 Civ. 8943 (CS)(JCM)

**JOINT STIPULATION REGARDING EXHIBITS
ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE DURING BENCH TRIAL**

WHEREAS, on January 22, February 10–14, 18–21, 24–27, and March 3, 5, and 24, 2020,
this Court held a bench trial in the above-captioned action;

WHEREAS, during the bench trial, the Court accepted into evidence certain exhibits, as
reflected in the trial transcripts;

WHEREAS, exhibits with the prefix “PX” were listed as trial exhibits by Plaintiffs, and
exhibits with the prefix “DX” were listed as trial exhibits by Defendant;

THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and among the
parties, through their undersigned counsel that:

1. The exhibits enumerated in Attachment A were proffered to and received into evidence, subject to the limitations in the notes column, by the Court during the bench trial in the above-captioned case;

2. The District Court shall enter Attachment A on the docket, as the agreed upon list of exhibits entered into evidence, subject to the limitations in the notes column, at trial;

3. The exhibits listed in Attachment A are part of the record on appeal in the above-captioned case.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: July 22, 2020

Latham & Watkins LLP

s/ Claudia T. Salomon

Claudia T. Salomon
claudia.salomon@lw.com
Corey Anne Calabrese
corey.calabrese@lw.com
Latham & Watkins LLP
885 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022

**New York Civil Liberties Union
Foundation**

Arthur Eisenberg
aeisenberg@nyclu.org
Perry Grossman
pgrossman@nyclu.org
New York Civil Liberties Union
125 Broad Street
New York, NY 10004

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: July 22, 2020

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

s/ David J. Butler

David J. Butler
Randall Levine
William Cravens
Clara Kollm
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004
T: (202) 739-3000
F: (202) 739-3001
david.butler@morganlewis.com
randall.levine@morganlewis.com
william.cravens@morganlewis.com
clara.kollm@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Defendant East Ramapo Central
School District*

SO ORDERED.


CATHY SEIBEL, U.S.D.J.

7/23/20

Attachment A

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX001	1/20/08 Official Election Results	2/12/2020	
DX002	5/19/09 Official Election Results	2/12/2020	
DX003	5/11/10 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX004	5/17/11 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX005	5/15/12 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX006	5/21/13 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX007	5/20/14 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX008	5/19/15 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX009	5/17/16 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX010	5/16/17 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX011	5/15/18 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results	2/12/2020	
DX012	5/21/19 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results, accessed December 2, 2019	2/12/2020	
DX013	Report of Dr. John Alford, PhD, with Table Errata re: Tables 3 & 6	2/12/2020	
DX014	1/24/17 A New Beginning: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District	2/12/2020	
DX015	"Register to Vote," ERCSD website, downloaded March 4, 2019 https://www.ercsd.org/Page/287	2/12/2020	
DX016	"Board of Education," ERCSD website, downloaded March 4, 2019, https://www.ercsd.org/domain/14_20	2/12/2020	
DX017	"Running for Board of Education," ERCSD website, downloaded March 4, 2019, https://ercsd.org/Page/290	2/12/2020	
DX018	"Board Members," ERCSD website, downloaded March 4, 2019, https://www.ercsd.org/Page/90	2/12/2020	
DX018A	ERCSD website printout, current list of board members.	2/24/2020	
DX020	12/10/09 Minutes of Meeting of December 10, 2009, East Ramapo Stakeholders	2/12/2020	
DX021	3/2/10 Minutes of Meeting of March 2, 2010, East Ramapo Stakeholders	2/12/2020	
DX022	Board Member Elections	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX023	2/14/13 Email from Steve White to denisekronstadt@gmail.com	2/12/2020	
DX024	2/10/17 Email from Steve White to Oscar Cohen	2/12/2020	
DX025	10/8/12 Email from Steve White to Peggy Hatton, with attachment	2/12/2020	
DX026	2011 Candidate Flyer from East Ramapo Stakeholders	2/12/2020	
DX027	1/12/16 mail from Steve White to poweroften@npogroups.org	2/12/2020	
DX028	12/18/15 Email from Steve White to several, with attachment (2016 Candidate Questionnaire.docx)	2/12/2020	
DX029	2016 Candidate Questionnaires	2/12/2020	
DX030	2/9/16 Email from Steve White to several others	2/12/2020	
DX031	2/4/18 Email from Steve White to Steve White re: candidate questionnaire	2/12/2020	
DX032	East Ramapo Coming Together website article "Our Goals," accessed February 7, 2018	2/12/2020	
DX033	12/14/12 Letter to Dr. Klein from Charles A. Szuberla	2/12/2020	
DX034	11/17/14 "East Ramapo: A School District in Crisis," by Hank Greenberg	2/12/2020	
DX035	Opportunity Deferred: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District, by Dennis Walcott	2/12/2020	
DX036	Continuing Progress: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District	2/12/2020	
DX037	South East Ramapo Taxpayer Association flyer for the 2008 election	2/12/2020	
DX040	2009 Sample Ballot	2/12/2020	
DX041	2012 Sample Ballot	2/12/2020	
DX042	2013 Sample Ballot	2/12/2020	
DX043	2014 Sample Ballot	2/12/2020	
DX044	5/8/15 Email from Cathy Russell to Steve White, with attachment ("ERCSD 2015 sample ballot – 05-08-15.pdf")	2/12/2020	
DX045	5/13/16 Email from Steve White to several, with attachment ("2016 sample ballot.pdf")	2/12/2020	
DX046	5/12/17 Email from Steve White to Alexandra Manigo, Chevone Dos Reis, Eric Goodwin, and Andrew Mandel, with attachment ("sample ballot 2017 copy.jpg")	2/12/2020	
DX047	2018 Sample Ballot	2/12/2020	
DX048	12/28/16 E-mail and attachment from S. White to Oscar Cohen, Subject: Emailing: Long Term issues	2/25/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX049*	10/14/14 E-mail from S. White to S. Venugopal, Subject: more info	2/25/2020	Only pages Bates stamped SW-0000044193 and SW-0000044194 admitted (Trial Tr. 2078:19-22).
DX050	2/23/15 Email and attachments from S. White to N. Morales, Subject: platform and more	2/12/2020	
DX051	3/11/13 Email from S. White to Power of Ten, Subject: Power of Ten Update	2/12/2020	
DX053	2/13/17 E-mail and attachment from S. White to A. Mandel & M. Pessin, Subject: Feb 16 agenda	2/12/2020	
DX055	12/17/15 East Ramapo Board member writes open letter to School Monitor Dennis Walcott, The Rockland County Times (accessed November 13, 2018)	2/12/2020	
DX059	Declaration of Dr. Matthew A. Barreto, with attachment (Preliminary Expert Report of Matthew A. Barreto, PhD & Loren Collingwood, PhD), with any disclosed materials, appendices, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX060	Declaration of Loren Collingwood accompanying the Preliminary Expert Report of Matthew A. Barreto, PhD. & Loren Collingwood, PhD, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX061	2/19/18 Declaration of Dr. John Alford in Support of Defendant East Ramapo Central School District's Opposition to Motion for Preliminary Injunction, dated February 19, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX062	3/28/18 Affidavit of Direct Examination of Dr. John Alford, dated March 28, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX063	9/14/18 Expert Report of William S. Cooper, dated September 14, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX064	9/26/18 Materials considered by Drs. Collingwood and Barreto, disclosed on September 26, 2018	2/12/2020	
DX065	9/28/18 Replication materials associated with Drs. Collingwood and Barreto Expert Reports and disclosed on September 28, 2018	2/12/2020	
DX066	9/14/18 Expert Report of Matthew A. Barreto, PhD. & Loren Collingwood, PhD., dated September 14, 2018, with exhibits, replication materials, appendixes, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data; and errata dated October 13, 2018	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX067	10/26/18 Expert Report of Dr. John Alford, dated October 26, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, data, replication materials, and errata (dated February 8, 2019)	2/12/2020	
DX068	11/16/18 Expert Rebuttal Report of Matthew A. Barreto, PhD & Loren Collingwood PhD, dated November 16, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, appendices, data, replication materials, and errata	2/12/2020	
DX069	12/7/18 Sur-Rebuttal Report of Dr. John Alford, dated December 7, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX070	12/7/18 Declaration of Dr. Peter A. Morrison, dated December 7, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX071	12/8/17 Report of William Cooper, dated December 8, 2017, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, and data	2/12/2020	
DX073	Power of Ten, "Facts About East Ramapo," including each nested webpage	2/12/2020	
DX074-003	1/4/12 Power of Ten Article, "1-4-12"	2/25/2020	
DX074-008	4/2/12 Power of Ten Article, "4-2-12"	2/25/2020	
DX074-013	5/10/12 Power of Ten Article, "5-10-12"	2/25/2020	
DX074-028	5/2/13 Power of Ten Article, "Reminder: Court Day Today"	2/25/2020	
DX074-031	5/12/13 Power of Ten Article, "Special Ed Parents: Important Meeting Monday May 13; NAACP Forum Reports"	2/25/2020	
DX074-059	5/19/15 Power of Ten Article, "Today: Vote! Rally in New City!"	2/25/2020	
DX074-077	5/16/16 Power of Ten Article, "Vote Tuesday"	2/25/2020	
DX074-085	3/3/17 Power of Ten Article, "Our 2017 Candidates"	2/25/2020	
DX074-086	3/8/17 Power of Ten Article, "Standing UP!"	2/25/2020	
DX074-100	3/11/18 Power of Ten Article, "Our 2018 Candidates"	2/25/2020	
DX074-117	4/28/19 Power of Ten Article, "Meet the Candidates"	2/25/2020	
DX074-120	5/16/19 Power of Ten Article, "Join Us Saturday!"	2/25/2020	
DX075	Power of Ten "The TLDR"	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX076	NYSED Archive of East Ramapo CSD (Spring Valley) Reports, including each hyperlinked report filterable data, accessed December 2, 2019	2/12/2020	
DX077	NYSED East Ramapo CSD (Spring Valley) At a Glance webpage, including each hyperlinked report and filterable data, accessed December 2, 2019	2/12/2020	
DX078	NYSED Enrollment data, Report Cards, Graduation Rates, Teach Evaluations, 3-8 Assessments, and Pathways Database for 1999–2019, including each hyperlinked report and filterable data, accessed December 2, 2019	2/12/2020	
DX084	The Education Crises for Children of Color Where Cultures and Values Conflict	2/12/2020	
DX085*	3/8/12 Letter to Commissioner King from Hazel Dukes	2/25/2020	Accepted not for truth but for the fact it was said (Trial Tr 1953:8-9).
DX086	1/7/13 Letter to Ms. Dukes from Dr. Oscar Cohen	2/12/2020	
DX088	11/21/17 Letter from Oscar Cohen, Ed. D.	2/12/2020	
DX090	1/15/13 Think Tank Meeting	2/12/2020	
DX091	NAACP Spring Valley Branch Official Correspondence	2/12/2020	
DX092	10/27/15 Letter from Timothy C. J. Blanchard to Willie Trotman	2/12/2020	
DX093	12/8/14 Email from Peggy Hatton to rocknet@npogroups.org	2/12/2020	
DX094	12/12/12 Email from Peggy Hatton to Steve White and others	2/12/2020	
DX095	12/10/09 East Ramapo Stakeholders Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
DX096	5/23/13 Letter to the Editor: Hatton Not Happy With E. Ramapo Vote, dated May 23, 2013, accessed September 26, 2018	2/12/2020	
DX097	4/10/14 Email from Peggy Hatton to Robert Forrest and Antonio Luciano	2/12/2020	
DX099	3/2017 M.V. Hood III et al., From Legal Theory to Practical Application: A How-to for Performing Vote Dilution Analyses, Social Science Quarterly	2/12/2020	
DX100	10/2008 Marc N. Elliott et al., A New Method for Estimating Race/Ethnicity and Associated Disparities Where Administrative Records Lack Self-Reported Race/Ethnicity, Health Services Research	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX101	2009 Marc N. Elliott et al., Using the Census Bureau's Surname List to Improve Estimates of Race/Ethnicity and Associated Disparities, Health Services & Outcome Research Methodology	2/12/2020	
DX157A	Polling Place Summary created by Mr. Cooper provided to Dr. Cole	2/14/2020	
DX158	Barreto/Alford CVAP Comparison Slides	2/21/2020	
DX159	Slides used with Mr. Cooper	2/21/2020	
DX160*	Catalist excerpt (names listed as black/Hispanic/unknown)	2/21/2020	Received as a list of selected names, not a summary of names (Trial Tr. 1593:13-14).
DX162	Excerpt from Alford Report	2/21/2020	
DX171*	Lohud video clip re Dr. Klein comments	2/20/2020	Received for fact they were said, not offered for truth (Trial Tr. 1336:19-20).
DX172*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Aron Wieder	2/19/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Jan. 30, 2020 Hr'g Tr. 16:13-18 and Trial Tr. 1149:3-8.
DX173*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Dr. Deborah Wortham	2/27/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Jan. 30, 2020 Hr'g Tr. 16:19-17:3.
DX174*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Harry Grossman	2/20/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Jan. 30, 2020 Hr'g Tr. 11:21-13:25.
DX175*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Pierre Germain	2/19/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Jan 30, 2020 Hr'g Tr. 10:23-11:20.
DX176*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Yehuda Weissmandl	2/26/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Jan. 30, 2020 Hr'g Tr. 14:16-16:12.
DX177*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Yonah Rothman	2/20/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Jan. 30, 2020 Hr'g Tr. 14:1-15.
DX180*	8/20/14 ERCSD Hearing video	2/20/2020	Received for fact they were said, not offered for truth (Trial Tr. 1336:19-20).
DX190*	3/20/13 Letter from O. Cohen to D. Brooks in re to column	2/25/2020	Partially admitted to the extent witness agrees to it (Trial Tr. 1954:25-1955:8; 1957:7-24).
DX193	11/12/14 Email from O. Cohen to S. White, "RE: Magazine improved"	2/25/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX197	11/12/14 Email from S. White to O. Cohen, "Magazine improved"	2/25/2020	
DX199	Slide re "Public School" Slate	2/25/2020	
DX200	1/31/13 Email from S. White to S. White re "Meeting Feb 7"	2/25/2020	
DX206	Bernard L. Fraga, "Candidates or Districts? Reevaluating the Role of Race in Voter Turnout"	2/26/2020	
DX209	Summer 2014 CFPB Report, "Using publicly available information to proxy for unidentified race and ethnicity: a methodology and assessment"	2/26/2020	
DX210	Catalist datasheet sorted by last name and address	2/26/2020	
DX211	Catalist datasheet sorted by last name and address - race mismatches	2/26/2020	
DX212	2010 Census Surname List - Unsorted Excerpt - Goldmunzer Row	2/26/2020	
DX213	Catalist Datasheet - Goldmunzer Detail 1	2/26/2020	
DX214	Catalist Datasheet - Goldmunzer Detail 2 - Mismatches	2/26/2020	
DX215	Map: New Square boundaries	2/26/2020	
DX217*	12/10/19 Letter from D. Wortham to L. Reynolds (Comptroller)	2/27/2020	Only Section II of letter on pages 2-4 admitted (Trial Tr. 2457:5-12).
DX218	Map: Goldmunzer address	2/26/2020	
DX219	8/16/17 Latham & Watkins engagement letter to S. White	2/25/2020	
DX228	Matthew Barreto et al., "Estimating Candidate Support in Voting Rights Act Cases: Comparing Iterative EI and EI-RxC Methods"	2/26/2020	
DX229	Slides re Dr. Alford Direct Examination	2/27/2020	
DX232*	Facebook chat between Sabrina Charles- Pierre, Harry Grossman, and Robert Ward Kurkela	3/3/2020	Only page Bates stamped CHARLES-PIERRE0496 admitted (Trial Tr. 2680:24-2681:6).
DX233*	WhatsApp chats of Sabrina Charles-Pierre w/ Harry Grossman, Yehuda Weissmandl, and group chats with ERCSD board and others.	3/3/2020	Only pages Bates stamped CHARLES-PIERRE1044 and CHARLES-PIERRE1079 admitted (Trial Tr. 2680:24-2681:6).
DX236*	Gary King, "A Solution to the Ecological Inference Problem," 1997	3/5/2020	Stipulated that document was published in 1997 (Trial Tr. 2748:12-18).
DX251*	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Bernard Charles, Jr.	2/26/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1780:20-1782:11.
DX252	Declaration of Trial Testimony of Catherine Russell	2/26/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
DX253	Declaration of Trial testimony of Sabrina Charles-Pierre	3/3/2020	
PX002	6/10/13 Email from O. Castor to M. Murphy re "school conditions" w/ picture attachments	2/13/2020	
PX003	4/5/13 Email from O. Castor to S. Rivera re "information about East Ramapo school district" w/ attachments	2/13/2020	
PX004	6/10/13 Email from O. Castor to W. Trotman re "ER high schools" w/ attachments	2/13/2020	
PX007	5/16/13 B. Charles Expenditure Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX008	6/11/13 B. Charles Expenditure Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX009	4/22/13 B. Charles Nominating Petition 2013	2/12/2020	
PX010	4/18/16 B. Charles Nominating Petition 2016	2/12/2020	
PX013	10/14/15 Email from H. Grossman to B. Charles re: "Regarding tonight's board meeting (10/13/15)"	2/24/2020	
PX017	3/13/13 Letter from C. Russell to B. Charles re Charles appointed to fill vacant seat	2/12/2020	
PX018	8/30/16 Statement of Y. Weissmandl re Recent Events	2/12/2020	
PX021	C. Dos Reis and K. Cancio Candidate Questionnaire	2/12/2020	
PX024	4/7/17 Email from strong-east-ramapo-volunteers@googlegroups.com to A. Mandel re "Door-to-Door This Weekend" and attachment "favorite_signs.pdf"	2/12/2020	
PX025	4/17/17 Strong East Ramapo: Press Release - Parents File Candidacy for East Ramapo School Board, Dos Reis, Goodwin and Manigo Seek to Ensure All Children Have a Voice	2/12/2020	
PX026	StrongER East Ramapo Board Election Door Hanger for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX027	StrongER East Ramapo Board Election Flyers for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX028	StrongER East Ramapo School Board Election Flyers for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX029	StrongER East Ramapo School Board Election Mailing for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX030	5/21/13 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results 2013	2/12/2020	
PX032	4/22/13 E. Clerveaux Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX033	6/10/13 E. Clerveaux Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX034	4/22/13 E. Clerveaux Nominating Petition 2013	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX035	5/16/13 R. Forrest Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013, M. Tuck Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013, E. Clerveaux Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX036	7/3/13 "VIDEO: East Ramapo district school board lawyer Christopher Kirby launches into profanity-laced tirade at parents," New York Daily News, by David Knowles, available at https://www.nydailynews.com/news/national/video-school-board-lawyer-flips-parents-article-1.1389526?barcpox=true Embedded videos available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=x1P-BWF5X4s , https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qsOcR2mYKq0	2/14/2020	
PX037	9/16/15 engageny PowerPoint Presentation East Ramapo: Update from the State Monitors, available at https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/Sep%202015/EastRamapoReportfromStateMonitors.pdf	2/12/2020	
PX038	4/18/16 J. Fields Nominating Petition 2016	2/12/2020	
PX039	2/24/11 Letter from A. Wieder to W. Trotman re W. Trotman's 2/16/2011 letter	2/12/2020	
PX040*	2/1/16 Letter from W. Trotman to D. Wortham and Y. Weissmandl re repairing Ramapo High School roof	2/19/2020	Admitted not for truth but for fact it was said and brought to the Board's attention (Trial Tr. 1272:4-10, 1313:2-6).
PX042	3/30/16 The Power of Ten #Women4ALL Post, https://poweroften.us/2499-2/	2/12/2020	
PX043	1/31/17 The Power of Ten Call for Candidates Post, https://poweroften.us/call-for-candidates/	2/12/2020	
PX044	5/16/16 The Power of Ten Vote Tuesday Post, https://poweroften.us/vote-tuesday/	2/12/2020	
PX045	5/17/16 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results 2016	2/12/2020	
PX046	5/16/17 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results 2017	2/12/2020	
PX047	2/14/17 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX048*	4/15/11 Letter from W. Trotman to A. Wieder re response to 4/5/2011 letter	2/19/2020	Admitted not for truth but for fact it was said (Trial Tr. 1271:9-11).
PX049	5/16/17 J. Freilich Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2017	2/12/2020	
PX050	4/13/17 J. Freilich Nominating Petition 2017	2/12/2020	
PX051	4/17/17 J. Freilich Nominating Petition 2017	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX052	5/11/17 SERTA 2017 Community Connections Campaign Advertisement (Freilich Dep. Ex. 5)	2/14/2020	
PX053	5/11/17 SERTA 2017 Community Connections Campaign Advertisement (Freilich Dep. Ex. 6)	2/14/2020	
PX054	5/4/17 SERTA 2017 Community Connections Campaign Advertisement (Freilich Dep. Ex. 7)	2/14/2020	
PX055	5/11/17 SERTA 2017 Community Connections Campaign Advertisement (Freilich Dep. Ex. 8)	2/14/2020	
PX056	5/4/17 SERTA 2017 Community Connections Campaign Advertisement (Freilich Dep. Ex. 9)	2/14/2020	
PX058	6/11/13 P. Germain Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX059	4/22/13 P. Germain Nominating Petition 2013	2/12/2020	
PX060	4/18/16 P. Germain Nominating Petition 2016	2/12/2020	
PX061	5/16/17 Email from strong-east-ramapo-volunteers@googlegroups.com to A. Mandel re "THIS IS IT: Election Day"	2/12/2020	
PX062	5/8/17 E. Goodwin ERCSD Board Campaign Speech	2/12/2020	
PX063	5/12/17 E. Goodwin Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2017	2/12/2020	
PX064	4/17/17 E. Goodwin Nominating Petition 2017	2/12/2020	
PX065	3/20/17 Email from A. Mandel to A. Manigo, C. Dos Reis, E. Goodwin, and A. Manigo re "captains for each of you to call"	2/12/2020	
PX067	StrongER East Ramapo Board Election Door Hanger for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX068	StrongER East Ramapo Board Election Door Hanger for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX070	StrongER East Ramapo School Board Election Mailing for Manigo, Goodwin, Dos Reis	2/12/2020	
PX073	7/18/16 Email from Y. Weissmandl to J. Lefkowitz, M. Hopstein, H. Grossman, Y. Rothman re "reminder - Board vacancy"	2/19/2020	
PX074	12/20/15 Excerpt of a WhatsApp communication between H. Grossman and S. Glick	2/20/2020	
PX075	3/18/15 Excerpt of a WhatsApp communication between H. Grossman and Y. Weissmandl	2/20/2020	
PX076	11/9/15 Excerpt of a WhatsApp communication between H. Grossman, D. Wanounou, Y. Rothman, M. Becker, C. Saperstein and others	2/21/2021	
PX077	2/14/17 Excerpt of WhatsApp communication between H. Grossman and J. Freilich	2/14/2020	
PX078	4/17/14 H. Grossman Nominating Petition 2014	2/12/2020	
PX079	4/13/17 H. Grossman Nominating Petition 2017	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX080*	Excerpt of a WhatsApp communication including J. Petlin, H. Grossman, H. Horowitz, Y. Weissmandl, C. Saperstein, A. Kraus, D. Rakover, R. Feiner, S. Glick, M. Becker and others	2/18/2020	Only pages PX080_001, -279, -427, -738-39, -758-61, -772-75, -801, -1260-61, -1306, -1451-53, -1532, -1552, -1646-47 admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 995:12-997:17, 1072:16-1074:7, 1080:15-1083:23, 1135:14-1137:20, 1394:20-1396:6, 1399:16-1403:10, 1465:10-18, 1465:24-1467:13, 1467:15-1471:24, 1472:8-1474:22, 1474:25-1476:8, 1486:23-1488:15, 1513:7-21, 1526:4-1529:9, 2607:4-2612:22, 2614:13-2617:17, 2620:14-2624:14, 2627:24-2644:10, 2646:2-2648:21, 2654:17-2658:8.
PX081	12/3/15 Excerpt of a Facebook Messenger communication between H. Grossman and S. Charles-Pierre	2/21/2020	
PX088*	1/19/16 Excerpt of a WhatsApp communication between H. Grossman and H. Horowitz	2/18/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 956:10-16; 999:18-25, 1437:7-10.
PX092*	11/17/17 Letter from W. Trotman to C. Szuberla re assistance	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1272:4-10, 1311:4-1312:23.
PX093*	2/5/18 Letter from W. Trotman to C. Szuberla re objectives combatting racial discrimination and segregation	2/19/2020	Admitted not for truth but for the fact that the information was conveyed to the board (Court characterized this as a 'letter to the board' but they were only copied) (Trial Tr. 1273:7-9).
PX094*	10/30/17 Letter from W. Trotman to C. Szuberla, Pro. J. Sipple re Monitors Report	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1272:4-10, 1311:4-1312:23.
PX095*	6/25/17 Letter from W. Trotman to C. Szuberla, Pro. Sipple re Board Members' attitudes	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1272:4-10, 1311:4-1312:23.
PX098*	2/28/17 Letter from W. Trotman to Commissioner Elia re concerns discussed at meeting	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1275:2-12.
PX101*	9/17/15 Letter from W. Trotman to D. Walcott of NYS Education Dept. re dysfunctional nature of ERCS D governance	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1274:22-25.

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX102	11/23/15 Letter from W. Trotman to D. Walcott of NYS Education Dept. re state- appointed monitor	2/12/2020	
PX103	2/20/13 Letter from W. Trotman to Dr. Klein re budget cuts	2/19/2020	
PX104	3/11/15 Letter from W. Trotman to Dr. Klein re Spanish language interpreters at board meetings	2/19/2020	
PX105*	8/7/17 Letter from W. Trotman to Dr. Wortham re meeting summary	2/19/2020	Admitted for the fact that it was said (Trial Tr. 1313:19-1314:7).
PX106*	4/25/17 Memorandum from W. Trotman to Dr. Wortham, C. Szuberla, Prof. J. Sipple re meeting summary	2/19/2020	Last bullet on pg. 1, Item D, admitted for truth (Trial Tr. 1312:9-23).
PX107	4/29/16 Letter from W. Trotman to Gov. Cuomo re bill support	2/12/2020	
PX108*	10/25/14 Letter from W. Trotman to U.S. Dept. of Education re discriminatory act by Superintendent J. Klein	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with ruling at Trial Tr. 1271:12-14.
PX109*	10/10/16 Letter from W. Trotman to Y. Weissmandl re cultural training diversity	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1272:4-10, 1311:4-1312:23.
PX111*	6/24/16 Letter from W. Trotman to Y. Weissmandl re testing school's water	2/19/2020	Admitted not for truth but for fact it was said (1272:4-10).
PX126	5/19/15 Y. Rothman Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2015	2/12/2020	
PX127	6/15/12 Y. Rothman Expenditure Statement 2012	2/12/2020	
PX128	4/16/12 Y. Rothman Nominating Petition 2012	2/12/2020	
PX129	4/20/15 Y. Rothman Nominating Petition 2015	2/12/2020	
PX130	6/12/13 M. Corado's Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2013	2/12/2020	
PX132	7/18/16 Email from C. Russell to B. Charles, J. Lefkowitz, D. Wortham, H. Grossman, M. Hopstein, S. Charles-Pierre, Y. Weissmandl, Y. Rothman, P. Germain re "reminder - Board vacancy" attaching letters/resumes	2/21/2020	
PX133	7/14/16 ERCSD Board Organization Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX134	7/14/16 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX135	8/2/16 ERCSD Board Special Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX136	7/26/16 ERCSD Board Special Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX137	5/24/17 H. Grossman's Expenditure and Contribution Statement 2017	2/12/2020	
PX140*	4/1/13 Letter from C. Williams-Pulakos to D. Schwartz re Albert D'Agostino	2/20/2020	Accepted not for truth but for fact that it was said (Trial Tr. 1301:4-1302:7).

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX141	1/21/13 Letter from S. Price to C. Russell re resignation from Board	2/19/2020	
PX142	1/21/13 Letter from S. Young-Mercer to C. Russell re resignation from Board	2/24/2020	
PX143*	1/26/17 Letter from W. Trotman to Y. Weissmandl re proposed redistricting of polling sites	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1275:2-12.
PX144	2/7/17 Letter from Y. Weissmandl to W. Trotman re proposed redistricting of polling sites	2/19/2020	
PX145	6/27/17 M. Berkowitz's Expenditure Statement 2017	2/12/2020	
PX146	1/9/17 Memo re Redistricting of school poll locations	2/18/2020	
PX148	1/9/18 School Election Re-districting Project Board Presentation	2/24/2020	
PX150	9/2/03 East Ramapo Board of Education Board Member Oath of Office 2122 Policy	2/12/2020	
PX151	9/2/03 East Ramapo Board Reorganizational Meeting 2210 Policy	2/12/2020	
PX152	11/17/14 East Ramapo: A School District in Crisis by H. Greenberg	2/12/2020	
PX154*	3/23/11 Letter from W. Trotman to A. Wieder re Wieder's 2/24/2011 letter	2/19/2020	Only second part of letter regarding moving parent participation to the end received for truth (Trial Tr. 1311:23-1312:3).
PX155*	11/9/10 NAACP v ERCSD OCR Complaint and Exhibits	2/19/2020	Admitted for the fact that it was said (Trial Tr. 1313:7-10).
PX156	12/1/15 Opportunity Deferred: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District by D. Walcott, M. George-Fields, and J. Sipple	2/12/2020	
PX157	10/27/15 U.S. DOE Office of Civil Rights' Letter to W. Trotman	2/18/2020	
PX158	5/19/15 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results 2015	2/12/2020	
PX161	10/15/15 Email from H. Grossman to P. Germain re: Regarding tonight's board meeting (10/13/15)	2/19/2020	
PX165	7/30/15 Email from Y. Weissmandl to A. Mandel re "Board vacancy"	2/19/2020	
PX167	Letter from J. Chajmowicz to Board of Education re board vacancy	2/19/2020	
PX168	6/13/16 Letter from J. Fields to Y. Weissmandl re consideration for vacant board seat attaching resume	2/19/2020	
PX169	11/26/14 Letter from J. King to Y. Weissmandl re appointment of Henry Greenberg as Fiscal Monitor	2/18/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX170	4/21/17 Letter from M. Elia to Y. Weissmandl re 2017-18 proposed budget	2/18/2020	
PX172	2/14/14 Letter from W. Trotman to Y. Weissmandl re appointment of Harry Grossman	2/19/2020	
PX173	4/18/11 Y. Weissmandl Nominating Petition 2011	2/12/2020	
PX174	4/18/16 Y. Weissmandl Nominating Petition 2016	2/12/2020	
PX179	CV of Dr. Loren Collingwood	2/12/2020	
PX180	CV of Dr. Matthew Barreto	2/12/2020	
PX182	2/11/19 Document titled "BISGvsCVAP_2015" attached to District's Feb. 11, 2019 Letter	2/12/2020	
PX183	2/11/19 Document titled "BISGvsCVAP_2015_2017" attached to District's Feb. 11, 2019 Letter	2/11/2020	
PX184	4/22/10 East Ramapo Central School District Staff Newsletter Chalk Talk - Board Adopts the 2010-2011 Budget	2/12/2020	
PX185	4/1/09 Education Matters Newsletter Vol VIII No 8	2/12/2020	
PX186	5/14/08 Email from A. Wieder to J. Grossman re "(No Subject)"	2/19/2020	
PX187*	5/14/08 Email from J. Grossman to undisclosed recipients re "Upcoming School Board Elections"	2/19/2020	Admitted not for truth but for fact that statements were made (Trial Tr. 1167:21-25).
PX188	5/18/08 Email from M. Horowitz to A. Wieder re "FW: Phone calls" with attachment "instruction for east ramapo.docx"	2/19/2020	
PX189	5/11/07 Email from M. Horowitz to A. Wieder re "Things for today"	2/19/2020	
PX195	11/18/09 ERCSD Audit Committee and Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX196	7/1/09 ERCSD Board Organization Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX197	7/24/12 ERCSD Board Public Hearing, Meeting of the Audit Committee, and Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX198	7/28/10 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX199	5/25/11 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX200	4/19/10 ERCSD Board Special Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX201	4/1/09 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX203	7/19/16 Letter from M. Elia to East Ramapo Community re \$3 million state funding grant to the District	2/25/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX204	NYSED East Ramapo CSD (Spring Valley) Data, available at https://data.nysed.gov/profile.php?instid=800000039112	2/12/2020	
PX205	NYSED Data for NonPublic Enrollment by Race/Ethnicity, available at http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/statistics/nonpublic/home.html	2/12/2020	
PX206	1/24/17 A New Beginning: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District by C. Szuberla and J. Sipple	2/12/2020	
PX207	10/1/17 Balanced Budget: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District by C. Szuberla and J. Sipple	2/12/2020	
PX208	12/1/18 Continuing Progress: A Report on the East Ramapo Central School District by C. Szuberla and J. Sipple	2/12/2020	
PX209	9/2/03 East Ramapo Board of Education Board Member Qualifications 2121 Policy	2/12/2020	
PX210	6/10/14 Letter from J. King to J. Klein re appointing fiscal monitor	2/18/2020	
PX211	NYSED, Notice to the East Ramapo Central School District Community Regarding the Result of a Finding of Continuing Noncompliance	2/18/2020	
PX212	6/6/11 NYSED Commissioner's Decision No. 16,239	2/18/2020	
PX213	11/17/14 NYSED November 17, 2014 meeting of the NYS Board of Regents Transcript	2/18/2020	
PX214	11/1/19 Office of New York State Comptroller, Report of Examination: East Ramapo Central School District Nonpublic School Transportation, available at https://osc.state.ny.us/localgov/audits/schools/2019/east-ramapo-2019-107.pdf	2/18/2020	
PX216	11/17/14 Video of NYSED November 17, 2014 meeting of the NYS Board of Regents, Hank Greenberg Presentation, available at https://www.regents.nysed.gov/video/board-regents-meeting-november-17-2014-hank-greenburg-presentation	2/18/2020	
PX217	2/25/15 NYSED's Office of Bilingual Education and World Languages Monitoring Report	2/18/2020	
PX218	Community Connections Advertisements, including Translation and Certificate of Accuracy	2/19/2020	
PX219	5/18/08 Email from A. Wieder to J. Wolfset re (no subject)	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX220	3/1/12 Education Matters Newsletter Vol XI No VI	2/12/2020	
PX222	12/4/14 Letter from W. Trotman to J. Klein re Spanish interpreter at Dec 2, 2014 board meeting	2/19/2020	
PX223	12/12/16 Letter from W. Trotman to C. Szuberla re requests for information regarding cultural diversity training of board members	2/25/2020	
PX224	7/13/15 Letter from C. Szuberla to the P-12 Education Committee regarding the District	2/18/2020	
PX225	3/23/11 Letter from W. Trotman to N. Rothschild re efforts to bring unity in ERCSD	2/19/2020	
PX226*	4/18/11 Letter from W. Trotman to A. Wieder re District Budget Vote and Election	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with ruling at Trial Tr. 1274:16-21.
PX227*	8/7/15 Letter from W. Trotman to P. Modica and M. Schwab re effigy in blackface	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with ruling at Trial Tr. 1275:14-16.
PX228*	4/25/17 Letter from W. Trotman to D. Wortham, C. Szuberla, and J. Sipple re April 6, 2017 meeting summary	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with ruling at Trial Tr. 1274:8-15.
PX229	7/1/13 Office of NYS Comptroller East Ramapo Central School District Financial Condition Report of Examination July 1, 2009 - February 1, 2013, available at https://www.ercsd.org/site/handlers/filedownload.ashx?moduleinstanceid=272&dataid=3000&FileName=East-Ramapo-CSD--OSC-Report-of-Examinations---07-01-09-through-02-01-13.pdf	2/18/2020	
PX230	12/13/10 Letter from Office of the State Comptroller to I. Oustacher and Board Members re school audit	2/18/2020	
PX231	8/1/11 NYS Office of the Comptroller East Ramapo Central School District Internal Controls Over Selected Financial Activities Report of Examination July 1, 2008 - April 13, 2010, available at https://www.ercsd.org/site/handlers/filedownload.ashx?moduleinstanceid=279&dataid=3059&FileName=East-Ramapo-CSD-NYS-Comptrollers-Audit--08-26-11.pdf	2/18/2020	
PX232	9/8/15 Voluntary Resolution Agreement between the District and the U.S. DOE OCR regarding the District's corrective action plan	2/18/2020	
PX234	5/17/11 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results 2011	2/12/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX235	5/15/18 Annual Budget & Trustee Vote Official Results 2018	2/12/2020	
PX238	4/1/10 Education Matters Newsletter Vol IX No 6	2/12/2020	
PX239	5/1/11 Education Matters Newsletter Vol X No 7	2/12/2020	
PX240	4/1/13 Education Matters Newsletter Vol XIII No VII	2/12/2020	
PX241	5/1/13 Education Matters Newsletter Vol XIII No VIII	2/12/2020	
PX242	9/14/18 Expert Report of Matthew A. Barreto, PhD & Loren Collingwood PhD, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, appendices, data, replication materials, and errata	2/11/2020	
PX243	11/16/18 Expert Rebuttal Report of Matthew A. Barreto, PhD & Loren Collingwood PhD, dated November 16, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, appendices, data, replication materials, and errata	2/11/2020	
PX244	9/14/18 Expert Report of William S. Cooper, dated September 14, 2018, with any disclosed materials, exhibits, appendices, data, replication materials, and errata	2/11/2020	
PX245	8/29/18 Letter to Latham & Watkins from Catalyst re New York Civil Liberties Union, et al. v. East Ramapo Central School District	2/25/2020	
PX246	Report by Yair Ghitza	2/25/2020	
PX247	Columnar document marked by deponent A through I ERCSD 2017 Board Member Elections.xlsx	2/25/2020	
PX248	Columnar document listing SD Poll, Name, Street Address, etc. July 2017 (affidavit voters)	2/25/2020	
PX249	Columnar document listing SD Poll Name, Street Address, etc. July 2017	2/25/2020	
PX250	Columnar document labeled by deponent A through T	2/25/2020	
PX251	12/14/11 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX252	9/2/03 East Ramapo Board of Education School Attorney 2270 Policy	2/18/2020	
PX253	3/17/10 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX257*	10/31/18 District Rule 30(b)(6) Deposition Transcript reflecting designations, counter-designations, and objections for both parties	2/19/2020	Plaintiffs' designations admitted except for lines 221:25-222:4 and 258:20-25 (Trial Tr. 1104:12-24).
PX258	2/20/19 Yair Ghitza Deposition Transcript reflecting designations, counter- designations, and objections for both parties	2/19/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX259	East Ramapo Central School District Board of Education website, available at https://www.ercsd.org/domain/1420	2/20/2020	
PX262*	4/16/19 Letter from W. Trotman to H. Grossman and D. Wortham re District's transportation proposal	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with ruling at Trial Tr. 1272:23-1273:3.
PX263*	12/20/19 Letter from W. Trotman to Comptroller T. DiNapoli re November 2019 Report of Examination 2019M-107, "East Ramapo Central School District Nonpublic School Transportation"	2/19/2020	Admitted consistent with ruling at Trial Tr. 1273:9-16.
PX264	5/28/13 Email from O. Castor to W. Trotman re "Emailing ersc REPORT CARD- double column-3.pdf" with attachment	2/13/2020	
PX266	1/8/19 Joint Stipulation Regarding the Authenticity and Admissibility of Reports by Monitors Appointed by the New York State Commissioner of Education and Exhibits	2/12/2020	
PX267	2/25/09 ERCSD Board Regular Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX268	7/2/13 ERCSD Board Organization Meeting Minutes	2/12/2020	
PX269	3/17/16 Kosuke Imai, et al., Improving Ecological Inference by Predicting Individual Ethnicity from Voter Registration Records (2016)	2/11/2020	
PX270	2018 Census Maps, based on data available at https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/sis/activities/geography/race-and-ethnicity-.html and https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/geography/data/interactive-maps.html , presented using Social Explorer (https://www.socialexplorer.com/a9676d974c/explore)	2/11/2020	
PX271	1988 Davidson, C., & Fraga, L. (1988). Slating Groups as Parties in a "Nonpartisan" Setting. The Western Political Quarterly, 41(2), 373-390	2/12/2020	
PX273	2/6/20 Bernard Charles, Jr. Press Release	2/24/2020	
PX274	Allen Fremont et al., "When Race/Ethnicity Data Are Lacking"	2/11/2020	
PX276*	3/16/18 New York Times Article, "Rabbi Mordechai Hager, Leader of Large Hasidic Sect, Dies at 95"	2/18/2020	Not received for truth, but for context of comments in PX80 (Trial Tr. 1076:20-23).
PX278*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Olivia Castor on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/13/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 328:15-330:24, 592:6-7.

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX279*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Chevon Dos Reis on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/13/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 646:8-647:2.
PX280*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Julio Clerveaux on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/14/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 689:9-24, 698:12-21.
PX281*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Eric Goodwin on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/14/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 779:2-19.
PX282*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Dorothy Miller on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/14/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 817:14-818:21, 826:6-25.
PX283*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Jean Fields on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/14/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 858:7-860:11, 871:5-22.
PX286*	1/9/20 Stephen Price Affidavit of Direct Testimony	2/19/2020	Partially admitted consistent with withdrawals and rulings at Trial Tr. 330:25-333:9.
PX288*	1/13/20 Affidavit Constituting the Direct Testimony of Willie Trotman on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/19/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1270:1-1275:18; 1311:4-1314:7.
PX289	12/19/12 Letter from J. DeLorenzo to J. Klein	2/25/2020	
PX291	Slides re Winning Candidates	2/24/2020	
PX292	11/21/17 Board Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/24/2020	
PX293	3/27/18 Board Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/24/2020	
PX294	2/11/14 Open Letter from Calherbe Monel to Yehuda Weissmandl	2/24/2020	
PX295	3/4/14 Board Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/24/2020	
PX300	U.S. Census Bureau data - Hispanic or Latino, and Not Hispanic or Latino by Race	2/25/2020	
PX301	U.S. Census Bureau data - Hispanic or Latino, and Not Hispanic or Latino by Race	2/25/2020	
PX302*	Excerpt of Catalist Datasheet - Individuals with the surname "Rubin"	2/21/2020	Received with the understanding that it is a selection of names, not a summary (Trial Tr. 1688:9-25).
PX303	Excerpt of Catalist Datasheet - Individuals with the surname "Cohen"	2/21/2020	
PX304	Catalist datasheet - individuals named Braun	2/25/2020	
PX305	Slides re Barreto Direct Testimony	2/21/2020	
PX311	Slides - William Cooper - Redistricting and Demographics	2/25/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX312	Slides - William Cooper - Redistricting and Demographics	2/25/2020	
PX314	4/18/19 Petition for Nomination of Joselito Cintron to School Board	2/24/2020	
PX315	ERCSD voter rolls	2/24/2020	
PX316	Expenditure and Contribution Statement for Candidate Jose Cintron	2/24/2020	
PX323	Excel spreadsheet listing polling places.	3/3/2020	
PX324	ERCSD List of Voters / Polling Places	2/25/2020	
PX325	11/26/14 Letter from J. King to D. Carlucci re Greenberg Report	2/25/2020	
PX326	4/7/17 Email from C. Russell to O. Cohen, "Re: Foil Request Spring Valley NAACP"	2/25/2020	
PX327*	9/23/14 Letter from H. Greenberg to J. Klein re Response to Cohen and Trotman Letter	2/25/2020	Received not for truth but for fact it was said (Trial Tr. 1925:17-24).
PX328*	9/4/14 Letter from O. Cohen and W. Trotman to J. Klein re Klein's 8/19/14 statement on immigrant influx	2/25/2020	Received not for truth but for fact it was said (Trial Tr. 1925:17-24).
PX329*	9/15/14 Letter from J. Klein to O. Cohen and W. Trotman	2/25/2020	Received not for truth but for fact it was said (Trial Tr. 1925:17-24).
PX330	Map re 2019 Joselito Cintron petition	3/3/2020	
PX332	7/26/16 Minutes of Special Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX333	5/17/16 Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX334	6/7/16 Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX335	6/21/16 Board Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX336	6/28/16 Minutes of Special Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX337	7/14/16 Board Minutes of Organization Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX338	7/14/16 Board Minutes of Regular Meeting	2/25/2020	
PX339*	Deposition Excerpts from Plaintiffs' Video Clips	2/25/2020	Defendant permitted to object post-trial on basis of question as to impeachment (Trial Tr. 1990:6-1991:25).
PX340	Excerpts of PX80 Used at Trial	2/25/2020	
PX341	Direct Testimony of Jennifer Felder	2/26/2020	
PX342*	Affidavit Constituting Direct Testimony of Oscar Cohen on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/25/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1899:3-1900:16.
PX343*	Affidavit Constituting Direct Testimony of Suzanne Young-Mercer on Behalf of Plaintiffs	2/24/2020	Partially admitted consistent with rulings at Trial Tr. 1869:13-1871:7 and withdrawals at Trial Tr. 1873:15-1874:4.
PX347	Chart showing votes for candidates by precinct and race	2/26/2020	

Trial Exhibit No.	Description	Date Admitted	*Notes
PX352	1/25/16 Power of Ten Article, "Time to Start Thinking About May"	2/26/2020	
PX353	1/31/17 Power of Ten Article, "Call for Candidates"	2/26/2020	
PX354	1/25/18 Power of Ten Article, "Your Signature of Support"	2/26/2020	
PX355	3/11/19 Power of Ten Article, "One Million Views!"	2/26/2020	
PX360*	5/2/17 Andrew Mandel Facebook post	3/3/2020	Received not for truth but for the fact the statement was posted publicly (Trial Tr. 2627:14-22).
PX361	5/5/17 Email from S. Charles-Pierre to A. Manigo	3/3/2020	
PX362	5/5/17 Email from S. Charles-Pierre to A. Manigo	3/3/2020	
PX363	5/5/17 Email from S. Charles-Pierre to A. Manigo	3/3/2020	
PX364	B. Grofman and M. Barreto, "A Reply to Zax's (2002) Critique of Grofman and Migalski (1988): Double-Equation Approaches to Ecological Inference Wh..."	3/5/2020	
PX367	B. Fraga, "Candidates or Districts? Reevaluating the Role of Race in Voter Turnout"	3/5/2020	
PX368	R. Enos, "What the Demolition of Public Housing Teaches Us about the Impact of Racial Threat on Political Behavior"	3/5/2020	
PX369	B. Fraga, "The Turnout Gap: Race, Ethnicity, and Political Inequality in a Diversifying America"	3/5/2020	
PX370	J. Grumbach, "Race and Representation in Campaign Finance"	3/5/2020	
PX371	M. Barreto, L. Collingwood, et al., "Estimating Candidate Support in Voting Rights Act Cases: Comparing Iterative EI and EI-RxC Methods"	3/5/2020	
PX372	NYSED Nonpublic Enrollment Data	3/5/2020	
PX373	M. Barreto Rebuttal Examination Slides	3/5/2020	
PX374	Excel file, "ny2017race_output_withprecinct"	3/5/2020	